

(2) Each objection is separately numbered.

(3) Each objection specifies with particularity the provision of the regulation or proposed order objected to.

(4) Each objection on which a hearing is requested specifically so states. Failure to request a hearing on an objection constitutes a waiver of the right to a hearing on that objection.

(5) Each objection for which a hearing is requested includes a detailed description and analysis of the factual information to be presented in support of the objection. Failure to include a description and analysis for an objection constitutes a waiver of the right to a hearing on that objection. The description and analysis may be used only for the purpose of determining whether a hearing has been justified under § 12.24, and do not limit the evidence that may be presented if a hearing is granted.

(i) A copy of any report, article, survey, or other written document relied upon must be submitted, except if the document is—

(a) An FDA document that is routinely publicly available;

(b) A recognized medical or scientific textbook that is readily available to the agency; or

(c) A designated journal listed in § 510.95.

(ii) A summary of the nondocumentary testimony to be presented by any witnesses relied upon must be submitted.

(b) Requests for hearing submitted under § 12.21 will be submitted to the Dockets Management Branch and will be accepted for filing if they meet the following conditions:

(1) They are submitted on or before the 30th day after the date of publication of the notice of opportunity for hearing.

(2) They comply with §§ 314.200, 514.200, or 601.7(a).

(c) If an objection or request for a public hearing fails to meet the requirements of this section and the deficiency becomes known to the Dockets Management Branch, the Dockets Management Branch shall return it with a copy of the applicable regulations, indicating those provisions not complied with. A deficient objection or request for a hearing may be supplemented and

subsequently filed if submitted within the 30-day time period specified in § 12.20(e) or § 12.21(b).

(d) If another person objects to a regulation issued in response to a petition submitted under § 12.20(a)(2), the petitioner may submit a written reply to the Dockets Management Branch.

[44 FR 22339, Apr. 13, 1979, as amended at 54 FR 9035, Mar. 3, 1989]

§ 12.23 Notice of filing of objections.

As soon as practicable after the expiration of the time for filing objections to and requests for hearing on agency action involving the issuance, amendment, or revocation of a regulation under sections 502(n), 701(e), or 721(d) of the act or sections 4 or 5 of the Fair Packaging and Labeling Act, the Commissioner shall publish a notice in the FEDERAL REGISTER specifying those parts of the regulation that have been stayed by the filing of proper objections and, if no objections have been filed, stating that fact. The notice does not constitute a determination that a hearing is justified on any objections or requests for hearing that have been filed. When to do so will cause no undue delay, the notice required by this section may be combined with the notices described in §§ 12.28 and 12.35.

§ 12.24 Ruling on objections and requests for hearing.

(a) As soon as possible the Commissioner will review all objections and requests for hearing filed under § 12.22 and determine—

(1) Whether the regulation should be modified or revoked under § 12.26;

(2) Whether a hearing has been justified; and

(3) Whether, if requested, a hearing before a Public Board of Inquiry under part 13 or before a public advisory committee under part 14 or before the Commissioner under part 15 has been justified.

(b) A request for a hearing will be granted if the material submitted shows the following:

(1) There is a genuine and substantial issue of fact for resolution at a hearing. A hearing will not be granted on issues of policy or law.

(2) The factual issue can be resolved by available and specifically identified

§ 12.26

reliable evidence. A hearing will not be granted on the basis of mere allegations or denials or general descriptions of positions and contentions.

(3) The data and information submitted, if established at a hearing, would be adequate to justify resolution of the factual issue in the way sought by the person. A hearing will be denied if the Commissioner concludes that the data and information submitted are insufficient to justify the factual determination urged, even if accurate.

(4) Resolution of the factual issue in the way sought by the person is adequate to justify the action requested. A hearing will not be granted on factual issues that are not determinative with respect to the action requested, e.g., if the Commissioner concludes that the action would be the same even if the factual issue were resolved in the way sought, or if a request is made that a final regulation include a provision not reasonably encompassed by the proposal. A hearing will be granted upon proper objection and request when a food standard or other regulation is shown to have the effect of excluding or otherwise affecting a product or ingredient.

(5) The action requested is not inconsistent with any provision in the act or any regulation in this chapter particularizing statutory standards. The proper procedure in those circumstances is for the person requesting the hearing to petition for an amendment or waiver of the regulation involved.

(6) The requirements in other applicable regulations, e.g., §§ 10.20, 12.21, 12.22, 314.200, 314.300, 514.200, and 601.7(a), and in the notice promulgating the final regulation or the notice of opportunity for hearing are met.

(c) In making the determination in paragraph (a) of this section, the Commissioner may use any of the optional procedures specified in § 10.30(h) or in other applicable regulations, e.g., §§ 314.200, 314.300, 514.200, and 601.7(a).

(d) If it is uncertain whether a hearing has been justified under the principles in paragraph (b) of this section, and the Commissioner concludes that summary decision against the person requesting a hearing should be considered, the Commissioner may serve upon the person by registered mail a

21 CFR Ch. I (4-1-98 Edition)

proposed order denying a hearing. The person has 30 days after receipt of the proposed order to demonstrate that the submission justifies a hearing.

[44 FR 22339, Apr. 13, 1979, as amended at 54 FR 9035, Mar. 3, 1989]

§ 12.26 Modification or revocation of regulation or order.

If the Commissioner determines upon review of an objection or request for hearing that the regulation or order should be modified or revoked, the Commissioner will promptly take such action by notice in the FEDERAL REGISTER. Further objections to or requests for hearing on the modification or revocation may be submitted under §§ 12.20 through 12.22 but no further issue may be taken with other provisions in the regulation or order. Objections and requests for hearing that are not affected by the modification or revocation will remain on file and be acted upon in due course.

§ 12.28 Denial of hearing in whole or in part.

If the Commissioner determines upon review of the objections or requests for hearing that a hearing is not justified, in whole or in part, a notice of the determination will be published.

(a) The notice will state whether the hearing is denied in whole or in part. If the hearing is denied in part, the notice will be combined with the notice of hearing required by § 12.35, and will specify the objections and requests for hearing that have been granted and denied.

(1) Any denial will be explained. A denial based on an analysis of the information submitted to justify a hearing will explain the inadequacy of the information.

(2) The notice will confirm or modify or stay the effective date of the regulation or order involved.

(b) The record of the administrative proceeding relating to denial of a public hearing in whole or in part on an objection or request for hearing consists of the following:

(1) If the proceeding involves a regulation—

(i) The documents specified in § 10.40(g);