S. 2453

To establish procedures for the review of electronic surveillance programs.

IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

March 16 (legislative day, March 15), 2006

Mr. Specter introduced the following bill; which was read twice and referred to the Committee on the Judiciary

A BILL

To establish procedures for the review of electronic surveillance programs.

- Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,

 SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.

 This Act may be cited as the "National Security Surveillance Act of 2006".

 SEC. 2. FINDINGS.

 Congress finds the following:
- 8 (1) After the terrorist attacks of September 11,
- 9 2001, President Bush authorized the National Secu-
- 10 rity Agency to intercept communications between

- people inside the United States, including American
 citizens, and terrorism suspects overseas.
- 3 (2) One of the lessons learned from September 4 11, 2001, is that the enemies who seek to greatly 5 harm and terrorize our Nation utilize technologies 6 and techniques that defy conventional law enforce-7 ment practices.
 - (3) The Commander in Chief requires the ability and means to detect and track an enemy that can master and exploit modern technology.
 - (4) Although it is essential that the President have all necessary means to protect us against our enemies, it is equally essential that, in doing so, the President does not compromise the very civil liberties that the President seeks to safeguard. As Justice Hugo Black observed, "The President's power, if any, to issue [an] order must stem either from an Act of Congress or from the Constitution itself.". Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 343 U.S. 579, 585 (1952) (opinion by Black, J.).
 - (5) In 2004, Justice Sandra Day O'Connor explained in her plurality opinion for the Supreme Court in Hamdi v. Rumsfeld: "We have long since made clear that a state of war is not a blank check for the President when it comes to the rights of the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Nation's citizens. Youngstown Sheet & Tube, 343 U.S., at 587, 72 S.Ct. 863. Whatever power the United States Constitution envisions for the Executive in its exchanges with other nations or with enemy organizations in times of conflict, it most assuredly envisions a role for all three branches when individual liberties are at stake." Hamdi v. Rumsfeld, 542 U.S. 507, 536 (2004) (citations omitted).

(6) Similarly, as Justice Jackson famously observed in his Youngstown concurrence: "When the President acts pursuant to an express or implied authorization of Congress, his authority is at its maximum, for it includes all that he possesses in his own right plus all that Congress can delegate. ... When the President acts in absence of either a congressional grant or denial of authority, he can only rely upon his own independent powers, but there is a zone of twilight in which he and Congress may have concurrent authority, or in which its distribution is uncertain. Therefore, congressional inertia, indifference or quiescence may sometimes, at least as a practical matter, enable, if not invite, measures on independent presidential responsibility ... When the President takes measures incompatible with the expressed or implied will of Congress, his power is at

- 1 its lowest ebb, for then he can rely only upon his 2 own constitutional powers minus any constitutional 3 powers of Congress over the matter. Courts can sus-4 tain exclusive Presidential control in such a case 5 only by disabling the Congress from acting upon the 6 subject.". Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 7 343 U.S. 579, 635–38 (1952) (Jackson, J., concur-8 ring).
 - (7) The Constitution provides Congress with broad powers of oversight over national security and foreign policy, under article I, section 8 of the Constitution of the United States, which confers on Congress numerous powers, including the powers—
 - (A) "To declare War, grant Letters of Marque and Reprisal, and make Rules concerning Captures on Land and Water";
 - (B) "To raise and support Armies";
 - (C) "To provide and maintain a Navy";
 - (D) "To make Rules for the Government and Regulation of the land and naval Forces";
 - (E) "To provide for calling forth the Militia to execute the Laws of the Union, suppress Insurrections and repel Invasions"; and
- 24 (F) "To provide for organizing, arming, 25 and disciplining the Militia, and for governing

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- such Part of them as may be employed in the Service of the United States".
 - (8) It is in our Nation's best interest for Congress to use its oversight power to establish a system to ensure that electronic surveillance programs do not infringe on the constitutional rights of Americans, while at the same time making sure that the President has all the powers and means necessary to detect and track our enemies.
 - (9) While Attorney General Alberto Gonzales explained that the executive branch reviews the electronic surveillance program of the National Security Agency every 45 days to ensure that the program is not overly broad, it is the belief of Congress that approval and supervision of electronic surveillance programs should be conducted outside of the executive branch, by the Article III court established under section 103 of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1978 (50 U.S.C. 1803). It is also the belief of Congress that it is appropriate for an Article III court to pass upon the constitutionality of electronic surveillance programs that may implicate the rights of Americans.
 - (10) The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court is the proper court to approve and supervise

- classified electronic surveillance programs because it is adept at maintaining the secrecy with which it was charged and it possesses the requisite expertise and discretion for adjudicating sensitive issues of national security.
 - (11) In 1975, then-Attorney General Edward Levi, a strong defender of executive authority, testified that in times of conflict, the President needs the power to conduct long-range electronic surveillance and that a foreign intelligence surveillance court should be empowered to issue special warrants in these circumstances.
 - (12) This Act clarifies and definitively establishes that the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court has the authority to review electronic surveillance programs and pass upon their constitutionality. Such authority is consistent with well-established, longstanding practices.
 - (13) The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court already has broad authority to approve surveillance of members of international conspiracies, in addition to granting warrants for surveillance of a particular individual under sections 104, 105, and 402 of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1978 (50 U.S.C. 1804, 1805, and 1842).

(14) Prosecutors have significant flexibility in investigating domestic conspiracy cases. Courts have held that flexible warrants comply with the fourth amendment to the Constitution of the United States when they relate to complex, far reaching, and multi-faceted criminal enterprises like drug conspiracies and money laundering rings. The courts recognize that applications for search warrants must be judged in a common sense and realistic fashion, and the courts permit broad warrant language where, due to the nature and circumstances of the investigation and the criminal organization, more precise descriptions are not feasible.

(15) Federal agents investigating international terrorism by foreign enemies are entitled to tools at least as broad as those used by Federal agents investigating domestic crimes by United States citizens. The Supreme Court, in the "Keith Case", United States v. United States District Court for the Eastern District of Michigan, 407 U.S. 297 (1972), recognized that the standards and procedures used to fight ordinary crime may not be applicable to cases involving national security. The Court recognized that national "security surveillance may involve different policy and practical considerations"

1	from the surveillance of ordinary crime" and that
2	courts should be more flexible in issuing warrants in
3	national security cases. United States v. United
4	States District Court for the Eastern District of
5	Michigan, 407 U.S. 297, 322 (1972).
6	(16) By authorizing the Foreign Intelligence
7	Surveillance Court to review electronic surveillance
8	programs, Congress preserves the ability of the
9	Commander in Chief to use the necessary means to
10	guard our national security, while also protecting the
11	civil liberties and constitutional rights that we cher-
12	ish.
13	SEC. 3. DEFINITIONS.
14	The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1978
15	(50 U.S.C. 1801 et seq.) is amended—
16	(1) by redesignating title VII as title VIII;
17	(2) by redesignating section 701 as section 801;
18	and
19	(3) by inserting after title VI the following:
20	"TITLE VII—ELECTRONIC
21	SURVEILLANCE
22	"SEC. 701. DEFINITIONS.
23	"As used in this title—
24	"(1) the terms 'agent of a foreign power', 'At-
25	torney General', 'foreign intelligence information',

- 'foreign power', 'international terrorism', 'minimization procedures', 'person', 'United States', and 'United States person' have the same meaning as in section 101;
 - "(2) the term 'congressional intelligence committees' means the Select Committee on Intelligence of the Senate and the Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence of the House of Representatives;
 - "(3) the term 'electronic communication' means any transfer of signs, signals, writing, images, sounds, data, or intelligence of any nature transmitted in whole or in part by a wire, radio, electromagnetic, photoelectronic or photooptical system, cable, or other like connection furnished or operated by any person engaged as a common carrier in providing or operating such facilities for the transmission of communications;
 - "(4) the term 'electronic surveillance' means the acquisition by an electronic, mechanical, or other surveillance device of the substance of any electronic communication sent by, received by, or intended to be received by a person who is in the United States, where there is a reasonable possibility that the surveillance will intercept communication in which a person in the United States participating in the

1	communication has a reasonable expectation of pri-
2	vacy;
3	"(5) the term 'electronic surveillance program'
4	means a program to engage in electronic surveil-
5	lance—
6	"(A) to gather foreign intelligence informa-
7	tion or to protect against international ter-
8	rorism or clandestine intelligence activities by
9	obtaining the substance of or information re-
10	garding electronic communications sent by, re-
11	ceived by, or intended to be received by a for-
12	eign power, an agent or agents of a foreign
13	power, or a person or persons who have had
14	communication with a foreign power seeking to
15	commit an act of international terrorism or
16	clandestine intelligence activities against the
17	United States;
18	"(B) where it is not feasible to name every
19	person or address every location to be subjected
20	to electronic surveillance; and
21	"(C) where effective gathering of foreign
22	intelligence information requires an extended
23	period of electronic surveillance

1	"(6) the term 'Foreign Intelligence Surveillance
2	Court' means the court, sitting en banc, established
3	under section 103(a);
4	"(7) the term 'Foreign Intelligence Surveillance
5	Court of review' means the court established under
6	section 103(b);
7	"(8) the term 'intercept' means the acquisition
8	of the substance of any electronic communication by
9	a person through the use of any electronic, mechan-
10	ical, or other device; and
11	"(9) the term 'substance' means any informa-
12	tion concerning the words, purport, or meaning of a
13	communication, and does not include information
14	identifying the sender, origin, or recipient of the
15	communication or the date or time of its trans-
16	mission.".
17	SEC. 4. FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE COURT
18	JURISDICTION TO REVIEW ELECTRONIC SUR-
19	VEILLANCE PROGRAMS.
20	Title VII of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act
21	of 1978, as amended by section 3, is amended by adding
22	at the end the following:

1	"SEC. 702. FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE COURT
2	JURISDICTION TO REVIEW ELECTRONIC SUR-
3	VEILLANCE PROGRAMS.
4	"(a) In General.—The Foreign Intelligence Sur-
5	veillance Court shall have jurisdiction to issue an order
6	under this title, lasting not longer than 45 days, that au-
7	thorizes an electronic surveillance program to obtain for-
8	eign intelligence information or to protect against inter-
9	national terrorism or clandestine intelligence activities.
10	"(b) Reauthorization.—In order to continue an
11	electronic surveillance program after the time period de-
12	scribed in subsection (a), the Attorney General shall sub-
13	mit a new application under section 703. There shall be
14	no limit on the number of times the Attorney General may
15	seek approval of an electronic surveillance program.
16	"(c) Modifications and Appeal in Event Appli-
17	CATION IS DENIED.—
18	"(1) IN GENERAL.—In the event that the For-
19	eign Intelligence Surveillance Court refuses to ap-
20	prove an application under subsection (a), the court
21	shall state its reasons in a written opinion.
22	"(2) Opinion.—The court shall submit a writ-
23	ten opinion described in paragraph (1) to the Attor-
24	ney General and to each member of the congres-
25	sional intelligence committees (or any subcommittee

thereof designated for oversight of electronic surveillance programs under this title).

"(3) Resubmission or appeal.—The Attorney General shall be permitted to submit a new application under section 703 for the electronic surveillance program, reflecting modifications to address the concerns set forth in the written opinion of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court. There shall be no limit on the number of times the Attorney General may seek approval of an electronic surveillance program. Alternatively, the Attorney General shall be permitted to appeal the decision of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court to the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court of Review.

"(d) Communications Subject to This Title.—

- "(1) IN GENERAL.—The provisions of this title requiring authorization by the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court apply only to interception of the substance of electronic communications sent by, received by, or intended to be received by a person who is in the United States, where there is a reasonable possibility that a participant in the communication has a reasonable expectation of privacy.
- "(2) EXCLUSION.—The provisions of this title requiring authorization by the Foreign Intelligence

- 1 Surveillance Court do not apply to information iden-
- 2 tifying the sender, origin, or recipient of the elec-
- 3 tronic communication or the date or time of its
- 4 transmission that is obtained without review of the
- 5 substance of the electronic communication.
- 6 "(e) Existing Programs Subject to This
- 7 TITLE.—
- 8 "(1) IN GENERAL.—The Attorney General shall
- 9 submit an application to the Foreign Intelligence
- 10 Surveillance Court for any electronic surveillance
- program to obtain foreign intelligence information or
- to protect against international terrorism or clandes-
- tine intelligence activities.
- 14 "(2) Existing programs.—Not later than 45
- days after the date of enactment of this title, the At-
- torney General shall submit an application under
- this title for approval of the electronic surveillance
- program sometimes referred to as the 'Terrorist'
- 19 Surveillance Program' and discussed by the Attorney
- General before the Committee on the Judiciary of
- the United States Senate on February 6, 2006. Not
- later than 120 days after the date of enactment of
- 23 this title, the Attorney General shall submit applica-
- 24 tions under this title for approval of any other elec-
- tronic surveillance program in existence on the date

1	of enactment of this title that has not been sub-
2	mitted to the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance
3	Court.".
4	SEC. 5. APPLICATIONS FOR APPROVAL OF ELECTRONIC
5	SURVEILLANCE PROGRAMS.
6	Title VII of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act
7	of 1978, as amended by section 4, is amended by adding
8	at the end the following:
9	"SEC. 703. APPLICATIONS FOR APPROVAL OF ELECTRONIC
10	SURVEILLANCE PROGRAMS.
11	"(a) In General.—Each application for approval of
12	an electronic surveillance program under this title shall—
13	"(1) be made by the Attorney General;
14	"(2) include a statement of the authority con-
15	ferred on the Attorney General by the President of
16	the United States;
17	"(3) include a statement setting forth the legal
18	basis for the conclusion by the Attorney General
19	that the electronic surveillance program is consistent
20	with the requirements of the Constitution of the
21	United States;
22	"(4) certify that the information sought cannot
23	reasonably be obtained by conventional investigative
24	techniques or through an application under section
25	104;

- "(5) include the name, if known, identity, or description of the foreign power or agent of a foreign power seeking to commit an act of international terrorism or clandestine intelligence activities against the United States that the electronic surveillance program seeks to monitor or detect;
 - "(6) include a statement of the means and operational procedures by which the surveillance will be executed and effected;
 - "(7) include a statement of the facts and circumstances relied upon by the Attorney General to justify the belief that at least 1 of the participants in the communications to be intercepted by the electronic surveillance program will be the foreign power or agent of a foreign power that is specified under paragraph (5), or a person who has had communication with the foreign power or agent of a foreign power that is specified under paragraph (5), and is seeking to commit an act of international terrorism or clandestine intelligence activities against the United States;
 - "(8) include a statement of the proposed minimization procedures;
- 24 "(9) include a detailed description of the nature 25 of the information sought and the type of commu-

- nication to be intercepted by the electronic surveillance program;
- "(10) include an estimate of the number of communications to be intercepted by the electronic surveillance program during the requested authorization period;
 - "(11) specify the date that the electronic surveillance program that is the subject of the application was initiated, if it was initiated before submission of the application;
 - "(12) certify that any electronic surveillance of a person in the United States under this title shall cease 45 days after the date of the authorization, unless the Government has obtained judicial authorization for continued surveillance of the person in the United States under section 104 or another Federal statute;
 - "(13) include a statement of the facts concerning all previous applications that have been made to the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court under this title involving the electronic surveillance program in the application, including the minimization procedures and the means and operational procedures proposed, and the Foreign Intelligence Sur-

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1	veillance Court's decision on each previous applica-
2	tion; and
3	"(14) include a statement of the facts con-
4	cerning the implementation of the electronic surveil-
5	lance program described in the application, includ-
6	ing, for any period of operation of the program au-
7	thorized at least 45 days prior to the date of submis-
8	sion of the application—
9	"(A) the minimization procedures imple-
10	mented;
11	"(B) the means and operational procedures
12	by which the surveillance was executed and ef-
13	fected;
14	"(C) the number of communications sub-
15	jected to the electronic surveillance program;
16	"(D) the identity, if known, or a descrip-
17	tion of any United States person whose commu-
18	nications sent or received in the United States
19	were intercepted by the electronic surveillance
20	program; and
21	"(E) a description of the foreign intel-
22	ligence information obtained through the elec-
23	tronic surveillance program.
24	"(b) Additional Information.—The Foreign In-
25	telligence Surveillance Court may require the Attorney

1	General to furnish such other information as may be nec-
2	essary to make a determination under section 704.".
3	SEC. 6. APPROVAL OF ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE PRO-
4	GRAMS.
5	Title VII of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act
6	of 1978, as amended by section 5, is amended by adding
7	at the end the following:
8	"SEC. 704. APPROVAL OF ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE
9	PROGRAMS.
10	"(a) Necessary Findings.—Upon receipt of an ap-
11	plication under section 703, the Foreign Intelligence Sur-
12	veillance Court shall enter an ex parte order as requested,
13	or as modified, approving the electronic surveillance pro-
14	gram if it finds that—
15	"(1) the President has authorized the Attorney
16	General to make the application for electronic sur-
17	veillance for foreign intelligence information;
18	"(2) approval of the electronic surveillance pro-
19	gram in the application is consistent with the duty
20	of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court to up-
21	hold the Constitution of the United States;
22	"(3) there is probable cause to believe that the
23	electronic surveillance program will intercept com-
24	munications of the foreign power or agent of a for-
25	eign power specified in the application, or a person

1	who has had communication with the foreign power
2	or agent of a foreign power that is specified in the
3	application and is seeking to commit an act of inter-
4	national terrorism or clandestine intelligence activi-
5	ties against the United States;
6	"(4) the proposed minimization procedures
7	meet the definition of minimization procedures
8	under section 101(h);
9	"(5) the application contains all statements and
10	certifications required by section 703; and
11	"(6) an evaluation of the implementation of the
12	electronic surveillance program, as described in sub-
13	section (b), supports approval of the application.
14	"(b) Evaluation of the Implementation of the
15	ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE PROGRAM.—In determining
16	whether the implementation of the electronic surveillance
17	program supports approval of the application for purposes
18	of subsection (a)(6), the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance
19	Court shall consider the performance of the electronic sur-
20	veillance program for at least 3 previously authorized peri-
21	ods, to the extent such information is available, and
22	shall—
23	"(1) evaluate whether the electronic surveillance
24	program has been implemented in accordance with

1	the proposal by the Federal Government by com-
2	paring—
3	"(A) the minimization procedures proposed
4	with the minimization procedures implemented;
5	"(B) the nature of the information sought
6	with the nature of the information obtained;
7	and
8	"(C) the means and operational procedures
9	proposed with the means and operational proce-
10	dures implemented;
11	"(2) consider the number of communications
12	intercepted by the electronic surveillance program
13	and the length of time the electronic surveillance
14	program has been in existence; and
15	"(3) consider the effectiveness of the electronic
16	surveillance program, as reflected by the foreign in-
17	telligence information obtained.".
18	SEC. 7. CONGRESSIONAL OVERSIGHT.
19	Title VII of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act
20	of 1978, as amended by section 6, is amended by adding
21	at the end the following:
22	"SEC. 705. CONGRESSIONAL OVERSIGHT.
23	"(a) In General.—The President shall submit to
24	each member of the congressional intelligence committees
25	(or any subcommittee thereof designated for oversight of

- 1 electronic surveillance programs under this title) a report
- 2 on the management and operational details of the elec-
- 3 tronic surveillance program generally and on any specific,
- 4 surveillance conducted under the electronic surveillance
- 5 program whenever requested by either of the committees,
- 6 or any such subcommittee, as applicable.

7 "(b) Semi-Annual Reports.—

- "(1) In General.—In addition to any reports required under subsection (a), the President shall, not later than 6 months after the date of enactment of this Act and every 6 months thereafter, fully inform each member of the congressional intelligence committees (or any subcommittee thereof designated for oversight of electronic surveillance programs under this title) on all electronic surveillance conducted under the electronic surveillance program.
- "(2) CONTENTS.—Each report under paragraph (1) shall include the following:
- "(A) A complete discussion of the management, operational details, effectiveness, and necessity of the electronic surveillance program generally, and of the management, operational details, effectiveness, and necessity of all electronic surveillance conducted under the pro-

1	gram, during the 6-month period ending on the
2	date of such report.
3	"(B) The total number of targets of elec-
4	tronic surveillance commenced or continued
5	under the electronic surveillance program.
6	"(C) The total number of United States
7	persons targeted for electronic surveillance
8	under the electronic surveillance program.
9	"(D) The total number of targets of elec-
10	tronic surveillance under the electronic surveil-
11	lance program for which an application was
12	submitted under section 104 for an order under
13	section 105 approving electronic surveillance,
14	and, of such applications, the total number ei-
15	ther granted, modified, or denied.
16	"(E) Any other information specified, in
17	writing, to be included in such report by the
18	congressional intelligence committees or any
19	subcommittees thereof designated for oversight
20	of the electronic surveillance program.
21	"(F) A description of the nature of the in-
22	formation sought under the electronic surveil-
23	lance program, the types of communications
24	subjected to such program, and whether the in-

formation sought under such program could be

- 1 reasonably obtained by less intrusive investiga-
- 2 tive techniques in a timely and effective man-
- 3 ner.
- 4 "(c) Form of Reports.—Any report or information
- 5 submitted under this section shall be submitted in classi-
- 6 fied form.".

7 SEC. 8. EMERGENCY AUTHORIZATION.

- 8 Title VII of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act
- 9 of 1978, as amended by section 6, is amended by adding
- 10 at the end the following:

11 "SEC. 706. EMERGENCY AUTHORIZATION.

- 12 "Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the
- 13 President, through the Attorney General, may authorize
- 14 electronic surveillance without a court order under this
- 15 title to, acquire foreign intelligence information for a pe-
- 16 riod not to exceed 45 days following a declaration of war
- 17 by Congress.".

18 SEC. 9. CONFORMING AMENDMENT.

- 19 The table of contents for the Foreign Intelligence
- 20 Surveillance Act of 1978 is amended by striking the items
- 21 related to title VII and section 701 and inserting the fol-
- 22 lowing:

"TITLE VII—ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE

- "Sec. 701. Definitions.
- "Sec. 702. Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court jurisdiction to review electronic surveillance programs.
- "Sec. 703. Applications for approval of electronic surveillance programs.
- "Sec. 704. Approval of electronic surveillance programs.
- "Sec. 705. Congressional oversight.

"Sec. 706. Emergency Authorization.

"TITLE VIII—EFFECTIVE DATE

"Sec. 801. Effective date.".

 \bigcirc